# NSTSCE

## National Surface Transportation Safety Center for Excellence

Sharing Participant Data Across Borders:

Ethical and IRB Concerns

Suzie Lee, VTTI



# The Perspectives

- International
- US
- Other countries
  - Canada
  - Australia
  - China
  - Etc.





# International Perspective

 Provides a common framework by which all countries can be compared



# **US** Perspective

- Began with Belmont Report
- Force of law
  - □ 45 CFR 46
  - Common Rule

THE BELMONT REPORT
ETHICAL PRINCIPLES AND GUIDELINES FOR THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN
SUBJECTS OF RESEARCH

The National Commission for the Protection of Human Subjects of Biomedical and Behavioral Research April 18, 1979

**SUMMARY:** On July 12, 1974, the National Research Act (Pub. L. 93-348) was signed into law, there-by creating the National Commission for the Protection of Human Subjects of Biomedical and Behavioral Research. One of the charges to the Commission was to identify the basic ethical principles that should underlie the conduct of biomedical and behavioral research involving human subjects and to develop guidelines which should be followed to assure that such research is conducted in accordance with those principles. In carrying out the above, the Commission was directed to consider: (i) the boundaries between biomedical and behavioral research and the accepted and routine practice of medicine, (ii) the role of assessment of risk-benefit criteria in the determination of the appropriateness of research involving human subjects, (iii) appropriate guidelines for the selection of human subjects for participation in such research and (iv) the nature and definition of informed consent in various research settings.

The Belmont Report attempts to summarize the basic ethical principles identified by the Commission in the course of its deliberations. It is the outgrowth of an intensive four-day period of discussions that were held in February 1976 at the Smithsonian Institution's



# **US** Perspective

Department of Agriculture

,					
10 CFR Part 745	Department of Energy				
14 CFR Part 1230	National Aeronautics and Space Administration				
15 CFR Part 27	Department of Commerce				
	National Institute of Standards and Technology				
16 CFR Part 1028	Consumer Product Safety Commission				
22 CFR Part 225	Agency for International Development (USAID)				
24 CFR Part 60	Department of Housing and Urban Development				
28 CFR Part 46	Department of Justice				
	National Institute of Justice				
32 CFR Part 219	Department of Defense				
34 CFR Part 97	Department of Education				
38 CFR Part 16	Department of Veterans Affairs				
	Office of Research Oversight				
	Office of Research and Development				
40 CFR Part 26	Environmental Protection Agency				
	Research and Development				
45 CFR Part 46	Department of Health and Human Services				
45 CFR Part 690	National Science Foundation				
49 CFR Part 11	Department of Transportation				

### Code of Federal Regulations TITLE 45 — PUBLIC WELFARE Department of Health and Human Services

### PART 46 PROTECTION OF HUMAN SUBJECTS

Revised June 23, 2005 Effective June 23, 2005

#### SUBPART A-Basic HHS Policy for Protection of Human Research

Subjects

46.101 To what does this policy apply? 46.102 Definitions.

46.103 Assuring compliance with this policy—research conducted or supported by any Federal Department or Agency.

46.104-46.106 [Reserved] 46.107 IRB membership.

46.108 IRB functions and operations. 47 400 TDD

#### SUBPART B-

Additional Protections for Pregnant Women, Human Fetuses and Neonates Involved in Research

#### Sec.

46.201 To what do these regulations apply?

46.202 Definitions.

46.203 Duties of IRBs in connection with research involving pregnant women, fetuses, and neonates.

46.204 Research involving pregnant women or fetuses.

#### SUBPART D-**Additional Protections**

for Children Involved as Subjects in Research

46.401 To what do these regulations apply?

46.402 Definitions.

46.403 IRB duties.

46.404 Research not involving greater than minimal risk.

46.405 Research involving greater than minimal risk but presenting the prospect of direct benefit to the in-



7 CFR Part 1c

## U.S. Office of Human Research Protection (OHRP)

- Provides guidance in all matters related to IRB and human subjects
- Provides for IRB registration
- Issues Federal-Wide Assurances
  - Can be granted to ethics boards in other countries
- Tracks changes in international law and policy
  - Publishes a comprehensive guide, updated annually



# OHRP International Compilation of Human Research Standards: 114 pp.

### Seven categories

- 1. General, i.e., applicable to most or all types of human subjects research
- Drugs and Devices
- 3. Research Injury
- 4. Privacy/Data Protection
- 5. Human Biological Materials
- 6. Genetic
- Embryos, Stem Cells, and Cloning

## Four Types of Information

- Key Organizations
- 2. Legislation
- Regulations
- 4. Guidelines



# Example – Canada, general

Country	Key Organizations	Legislation	Regulations	Guidelines
NORTH AMERI	ICA			
Canada  General  Note: Several Canadian provinces and territories also have standards on human subjects research.	National:  1. Interagency Advisory Panel on Research Ethics (PRE): http://www.pre.ethics.gc.ca/eng/index 2. National Defence 3. Correctional Service of Canada			PRE: Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans (2010): http://www.pre.ethics.gc.ca/eng/policy- politique/initiatives/tcps2-eptc2/Default/  National Defence: Research Involving Human Subjects (1998): http://www.admfincs.forces.gc.ca/admfincs/subjects/daod/5061/0_e.asp  Correctional Service of Canada: Commissioner's Directive - Research: DCOO9 (2004): http://www.csc-scc.gc.ca/text/plcy/cdshtm/009- cde_e.shtml



# Example – Canada, general

TRI-COUNCIL POLICY STATEMENT

# Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans

2010

Canadian Institutes of Health Research
Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada
Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada

### Compliance with the Policy

To be eligible to receive and administer research funds from the Agencies, institutions must agree to comply with a number of Agency policies set out as schedules to a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between the Agencies and institutions.<sup>2</sup> This Policy is referenced in Schedule 2 to that MOU. Institutions must therefore ensure that research conducted under their auspices adhere to this Policy. Researchers are expected, as a condition of funding, to adhere to the TCPS. Institutions should support their efforts to do so.



## Example – Canada, privacy/data protection

Country	Key Organizations	Legislation		Regulations	Guidelines
Privacy/Data	1. Office of the Privacy	1. Privacy Act, Sections 7-8	N	OPC:	PRE:
Protection	Commissioner of Canada (OPC): http://www.privcom.gc.ca/index_e.a.p	(1983): http://www.privcom.gc.ca/legis.atic		SOR/2001-6, SOR/2001-7, and OR/2001-8 (December 13,	Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans,
Note: Each of the Canadian provinces and territories has	2. Interagency Advisory Panel or Research Ethics (PRE): <a href="http://www.pre.ethics.gc.ca/eng/index">http://www.pre.ethics.gc.ca/eng/index</a> . Canadian Institutes of Health	n/02 07 01 e.asp 2. Personal Information Protection and Electronic Documents Act. Articles 5 and 7	7	2000)	Chapter 5: Privacy and Confidentiality 2010)
also enacted privacy legislation.	Research (CIHR): http://www.cih irsc.gc.ca/e/193.html	(2001): http://www.privcom.gc.ca/legisla/on/02_06_01_e.asp			CIHR. CIHR Best Practices for Protecting Privacy in Health Research (2005): http://www.cihr- irsc.gc.ca/e/documents/pbp_sept2005_e.pdf
77 n: -1:1	T4 D A d D 1	+	+		DDE.



## Lesson 1: Plan Ahead

- Begin planning far ahead of the start date of the research
- Do the research:
  - Ethical standards pertaining to country where data will be collected
  - Legal issues relating to sharing human subjects data
- Make sure the contract is clear on who will hold the data, how it will be shared, how long it will be held
  - Carry through to protocol and informed consent



# Lesson 2: Dynamic Field

- But don't plan too far ahead!
- Laws, guidelines, regulations, and policies change frequently, especially when considering multiple countries
- OHRP provides an annual update
  - Check the latest version

Canada: 2010

Australia: 2009

US: Currently considering a major overhaul



## Lesson 3: Translation

# Language translationCultural translation

EMBO reports (2006) 7, 850 - 854 doi:10.1038/sj.embor.7400794

Subject Categories: Ethics | Health & Disease

#### Bioethics in China

Although national guidelines are in place, their implementation remains difficult

#### Wolfgang Hennig

The history of bioethics in China is a rather short one: attention was first given to research and medical ethics in the 1960s. obligatory in the 1980s. In 1983, Qiu Xiangxing first published the textbook *Medical Ethics* for Chinese colleges (Qiu, 2005), medical students. The Chinese Association for Medical Ethics was also founded in the mid-1980s, and the Ministry of Publi medical ethics; however, these guidelines were not legally binding regulations. In 1998, the Ministry of Health issued a provi procedures for ethical reviews of any biomedical research involving humans in China. In detail, it regulates topics such as in investigators, the rights of research subjects, and the administrative management of ethical reviews and legal responsibilitie states that ethical reviews are "based upon the principles of ethics accepted by the international community".

66 ...Chinese regulations and guidelines do not substantially differ from those in Europe or the





# Lesson 4: Satisfy All Sides

- Now and into the future
- Abide by relevant laws, policies, guidelines
- Abide by the contract
- Uphold promises made to research participants
- Protect the data
  - Hold it securely
  - Share it according to agreed upon conditions



## Resources

- OHRP Compilation
  - http://www.hhs.gov/ohrp/international/intlcompilation/intlcompilation .html
- Belmont Report
  - http://www.hhs.gov/ohrp/humansubjects/guidance/belmont.html
- US Code of Federal Regulations
  - http://www.hhs.gov/ohrp/humansubjects/guidance/45cfr46.html
- Other resources available upon request:
  - Suzie Lee, <u>slee@vtti.vt.edu</u>

